



University of Warwick institutional repository: <http://go.warwick.ac.uk/wrap>

This paper is made available online in accordance with publisher policies. Please scroll down to view the document itself. Please refer to the repository record for this item and our policy information available from the repository home page for further information.

To see the final version of this paper please visit the publisher's website. Access to the published version may require a subscription.

Author(s): Stuart B. Jennings

Article Title: Quaker Constitutionalism and the Political Thought of John Dickinson

Year of publication: 2010

Link to published article:

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S000964071000034X>

Publisher statement: Copyright © American Society of Church History, Jennings, S. B., (2010), Quaker Constitutionalism and the Political Thought of John Dickinson, Church History, **79** (2), pp. 477-479, doi: 10.1017/S000964071000034X

Ward has written a highly original and engrossing book even if she does not fully credit the theological impediments in America to these Catholic devotional texts. Indeed, when Ward identifies marginal sects such as the Moravians as entry points for French Quietism, she demonstrates that evangelicalism of British origin was never monolithic.

Nonetheless, a sharper sense of national religious boundaries might have provoked fruitful questions. Why did Upham, a moderate Congregationalist with a respect for science, present Madame Guyon's self-abasing piety to his contemporaries as worthy of imitation rather than threatening? Circulating her story seemed normal to Upham, and his many readers apparently agreed. Was the appearance of his book one episode in the transformation of a strenuous theology of will into a modern religious sensibility more comfortable with the pursuit of spiritual desire? Ward's compelling story of the unlikely resonance of French and American inwardness opens further intriguing scholarly doors.

Anne C. Rose
Penn State University

doi:10.1017/S000964071000034X

Quaker Constitutionalism and the Political Thought of John

Dickinson. By **Jane E. Calvert**. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009. xiv+382 pp. \$99.00 cloth.

The Quaker impulse to reform and regulate both their meetings and wider society according to their religious experience of "the light within" lay at the heart of the movement's missionary zeal from its earliest days. Yet for both the social and political historian, the question of how a spontaneous, individualist, experiential, and dissenting religious tradition in revolutionary England evolved into a structured, bureaucratic system that was firstly turned inward upon its members to preserve a unity amongst themselves and later outward toward civil society and government has generated much discussion. Within an American context, in particular the Pennsylvania experiment, this development raises further questions about how this process amongst Friends was to feed and inform the evolution of federal ideas across the other colonies.

In a clearly argued and well researched thesis, Professor Calvert contributes greatly to this discussion by compiling a synthesis of previous research and her own unique findings. The conclusions, though clearly developed, are not always without controversy, but any future discussion will have to address many of the issues she has clearly articulated and for that we can only be grateful. The book is divided into two sections; the first explores the

evolution of Quaker Constitutionalism and practice across both sides of the Atlantic between the years 1652 and 1763, whilst the second picks up the influence of this development in the life and writings of John Dickinson, one of America's Founding Fathers.

The first two chapters of Professor Calvert's book seek to argue how a theologico-political system based on apparently irreconcilable tenets of unity and dissent, bureaucracy and liberty actually arrived at the place where they could settle the vexed issue of ultimate authority amongst themselves. She begins by outlining the way in which an order of government for local meetings began as early as the late 1650s though the creation of a central authority, in particular the Meeting for Sufferings, that took precedence over the individualistic and local tendencies was not really consolidated until the 1670s. As the author clearly demonstrates, it was initially the organisational requirements for charity and worship that drove the need for a formal constituted meeting structure. To those familiar with the early history of the Friends much of this debate will not be unfamiliar, though it is presented here with a degree of clarity that is extremely helpful. An examination of the significance of George Fox's longevity, as against the early death of so many of its first ministers, as a possible contributory factor to this development would have been useful in this discussion.

During the late 1660s and early 1670s the development of an ecclesiastical government, coupled with its complete adoption of George Fox's Peace Testimony, tempered and shaped the direction, though not the intensity of Quaker dissent. The earlier models of confrontation, dissent, and coercion within the life of the meeting were superseded by a new approach of peaceful persuasion. These same principles came to be applied to Quaker dissent in civil polity supported by the movement's theological commitment to the acceptance of change and the need to constantly revisit "first principals." Professor Calvert clearly portrays this process in the latter part of the first section of her book, devoting over two chapters to explore both the "holy experiment of Pennsylvania" and the impact of the experience upon subsequent thought and practice. In a clearly developed argument, the reader is shown how in Pennsylvania, Quaker religious practices and principals were the very foundations of the political experiment. Developing some of the issues initially identified by Alan Tully in his book *Forming American Politics* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1994), the author presents a commendable comprehensive overview of both the colony's experiences and the intellectual and theological issues they raised in subsequent Quaker thinking. Here the book is at its most piercingly perceptive.

John Dickinson, according to Professor Calvert, has never enjoyed the high profile in the historiography of the American Revolution that has been accorded to the other Founding Fathers. This in spite of the fact that he was

influential in the Stamp Act Congress, fought in the War of Independence, and at the Constitutional Convention of 1787 helped to draft legislation relating to the election of and powers for the president. Part of the reason for this may be the complexities and ambiguities of Dickinson's political thoughts and writings, which in the second part of her book she clearly demonstrates reflect his immersion into the Quaker political culture of 1760s Pennsylvania. Though he was born into a practicing Quaker family, and his wife and daughters were committed Friends, Dickinson himself rejected formal affiliation with any religious group. In his public life, however, he adopted plainness of speech and used the Quaker practice of naming days and months by numbers, and on his death he was buried in the Friend's cemetery at Wilmington. The great contribution of this whole volume is that it enables the reader to revisit Dickinson's political contribution with a broader understanding and sympathy toward its origins, thus bringing him again to the renewed interest of historians.

The volume is well organized, leading the reader progressively through sections on Quakerism in general, the Pennsylvania Experiment, and finally into the "political Quakerism" of John Dickinson. Though it covers a range of topics, Professor Calvert's lively narrative style makes for enjoyable reading. Her enthusiasm for her subject, though, does lead her to make some sweeping statements. Were Quakers really the only radicals to survive the interregnum (94) or just the ones that survived longest after it? And was the 1689 Toleration Act largely instigated by Quakers (54) who were noticeably absent from the political machinations of the climatic last few months of the reign of James II? These, though, are minor complaints that in no way detract from a very valuable contribution to this important debate.

Stuart B. Jennings
University of Warwick

doi:10.1017/S0009640710000351

Religion, Reform and Modernity in the Eighteenth Century:

***Thomas Secker and the Church of England.* By Robert G. Ingram.**

Studies in Modern British Religious History 17. Woodbridge:

Boydell, 2007. xvii+317 pp. \$90.00 cloth.

Revived interest in the eighteenth-century Church of England has perhaps focused too much on parishes. Were the parsons performing their duties satisfactorily? How effective was their pastoral ministry? How important was the Church for the laity? Hence biographies of the Church's leading figures—comparable to Norman Sykes's lives of Edmund Gibson and William Wake—have been somewhat neglected.